

Is that true that this narrative has been said Imam "Sadiq" [AS]?

“و عن الإمام الخامس محمد بن علي بن الحسين الباقر ، عن عروة بن عبد الله قال : سألت أبا جعفر محمد بن علي (ع) عن حلية السيف ؟ فقال : لا بأس به ، قد حلي أبوبكر الصديق سيفه ، قال : قلت : و تقول الصديق ؟ فوثب وثبة ، و استقبل القبلة ، فقال : نعم الصديق ، فمن لم يقل الصديق فلا صدق الله له قولاً في الدنيا و الآخرة”

“Al-Irbili” – Kashf al-Ghumma – vol.2, p 147

Response:

Firstly: this narrative has been quoted by late “Al-Irbili” from Sunni books and it’s not found in any of Shia book; thus we can’t accept it.

Secondly: in the document of this narrative written in “Siyar al-A’lam al-Nubala” book there is a guy named “Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Habish” {narrator} who is unknown and nothing has been said about him in Sunni books.

Thirdly: assuming that this narrative is valid, this hadith was said at the time of “Banu Umayyad” caliphate and if we take look at history of that time carefully we’ll get to answer.

“Banu Umayyad” caliphate and then “Banu Abbas” were so strict towards Shias that they even ordered anyone whose name is “Ali” to be killed; as many of Sunni scholars have quoted:

“كانت بنو أمية إذا سمعوا بمولود اسمه علي قتلوه”

If “Banu Umayyah” heard that someone’s name is “Ali”, they would kill him.

“Ibn Hajar”- Tahzib al-Tahzib – vol. 7- p 281 /// “Al-Duhahabi” – Siyar al-A’lam al-Nubala” – vol. 5 – p 102 /// “Al-Mizzi” – Tahzib al-Kamal – vol. 20 – p 429 /// “Ibn Asakir” – the History of Damascene – vol. 41 – p 418 and

So, In such situation it’s quite logical that such narratives have are said to save the life of Shias and because of “Taqiyyeh” {precautionary concealment of one’s faith or opinion about something when its disclosure is feared to jeopardize one’s life or threaten any harm or loss}; on the other hand narrator of this narrative is “Urwah Ibn Abdullah”, the enemy of “Ahl al-Bayt” [AS] and the supporter of “Banu Umayyad” caliphate.

The End