

Is "Abdullah" the name of imam Mahdi's [a.s] father?

Response:

Introduction:

To undo Shias' opinion about imam "Mahdi" [a.s], many of Sunni scholars have claimed that according to narratives the name of his father is "Abdullah".

"Ibn Taymiyah" who is the founder of "Wahhabism" has discussed this doubt in his well-known book "Minhaj al-Sunnah":

أن الاثني عشرية الذين ادّعوا أن هذا هو مذهبهم، مهديهم اسمه محمد بن الحسن. والمهدي المنعوت الذي وصفه النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم اسمه محمد بن عبد الله. ولهذا حذفت طائفة ذكر الأب من لفظ الرسول حتي لا يناقض ما كذبت. وطائفة حرّفته، فقالت: جده الحسين، وكنيته أبو عبد الله، فمعناه محمد بن أبي عبد الله، وجعلت الكنية اسما.

Shias who believe in twelve imams, the name of their "Mahdi" is "Muhammad ibn al-Hasan" while that "Mahdi" that messenger of god [PBUH] has described, his name is "Muhammad ibn Abdullah". That's why Shias have deleted this sentence «اسم ابيه اسم ابي» from the narrative of messenger of Allah [PBUH] so that it can't be in contradictory with their lies and a group of them have distorted this narrative and said: Mahdi's grandfather is "Husain" and his grandfather's nickname is "Abdullah". So, the meaning of Prophet Muhammad's narrative is that Mahdi's name is "Muhammad ibn Abdullah".

"Ibn Taymiyah Harani" – Minhaj as-Sunnah – vol. 8, p 260

He also says in another volume of his book:

وأحاديث المهدي معروفة، رواها الإمام أحمد وأبو داود والترمذي وغيرهم، كحديث عبد الله بن مسعود عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم أنه قال: لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يبعث فيه رجلا من أهل بيتي يواطئ اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي، يملأ الأرض قسطا وعدلا كما ملئت ظلما وجورا.

Narratives regarding "Mahdi" are well-known that were quoted by imam "Ahmad ibn Hanbal", "Abu Dawud" and "Tirmidhi" and others, like narrative of "Abdullah ibn Masud" from messenger of Allah [PBUH] who said: if only one day is left from this world, god will make it so long until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is like my name and name of his father is like my father's name, appears. He'll fill the earth with justice as it's filled with oppression.

"Ibn Taymiyah" – Minhaj al-Sunnah – vol. 4, p 95

According to what "ibn "Taymiyah" said, this doubt has two parts:

- 1: Shias' belief about parentage of hadrat "Mahdi" is in contradictory with narratives.
- 2: Shias deleted last words of narratives or distorted them until their belief matches with these narratives.

Before answering, it's necessary to say that "Ibn Taymiyah" has relied on narratives which are not proof for Shias at all and have no value for Shias. So, "Ibn Taymiyah" and his followers can't make Shias to accept narratives that enemies have quoted them. Moreover, we'll prove in this article that even these narratives aren't proof for Sunni.

Short response:

At first we deal with the response of second doubt and will prove by Sunni authentic narratives that this sentence «اسمه اسمي» {His name is my name} is written in their books without added words, with at least two authentic documents in Sunni opinion and quoted by several Sahaba of messenger of Allah [PBUH] such as; "Ibn Masud", "Abu Hurayra", "Huzyfa", "Ibn Abbas", "Abu Saed Khederi", "Abdullah ibn Umar".

Then we'll deal with narratives this extra sentence is written there «اسم ابيه اسم ابي» {Name of his father is like father's name} and it's proved that one of its narrators has some times quoted this narrative with this extra sentence and sometimes without it. So, we can't rely on his saying to prove these added words. And even Sunni scholars have said that this narrative isn't authentic.

We'll also quote sayings of Sunni scholars that – unlike Ibn Taymiya's opinion – this extra word has been added by those who claimed to be "Mahdi" to introduce themselves as promised "Mahdi" or to say that "Mahdi" of Shia is a lie.

Fist part: Sunni authentic narratives, without this phrase "And his father's name is the same as my father's name".

Narratives which have only this word "his name is the same as me", have been quoted from messenger of Allah [PBUH] via numerous persons:

A: by "Abu Hurayrah":

According to Sunni authentic narratives, one of sahaba who has quoted this narrative from messenger of Allah [PBUH] without this sentence "name of his father is the same as my father's name" is "Abu Hurayrah" and many of Sunni scholars have quoted this narrative in their books:

1: "Abu Isa Timidhi":

He's one of Sunni well-known hadith narrators. In his "Al-Sunan" book, he's at first quoted narrative of "Abdullah ibn Masud" and at the end, he quotes narrative of "Abu Hurayrah" and says that it's authentic:

حدثنا عبد الجبار بن العلاء بن عبد الجبار العطار حدثنا سفيان بن عيينة عن عاصم عن زر عن عبد الله عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: يَلِي رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمَهُ اسْمِي قَالَ عَاصِمٌ وَأَنَا أَبُو صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ قَالَ: لَوْ لَمْ يَبْقَ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا إِلَّا يَوْمٌ لَطَوَّلَ اللَّهُ ذَلِكَ الْيَوْمَ حَتَّى يَلِيَّ...

قال أبو عيسى: هذا حديث حسن صحيح.

"Ibn Masud" says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me will come. "Abu Hurayrah" has quoted that Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] said: if only one day left from the world, god will make it too long until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me appears.

"Abu Isa" has said that this narrative is authentic.

"Al-Tirmidhi" – Sunan al-Tirmidhi – vol. 4, p 505

Studying document of narrative:

"Tirmidhi" has said that this narrative is authentic, the same goes for "Albani". But to complete our discussion, we study its document completely:

Document of narrative is as follow {narrators}:

1: "Abu Isa al-Tirmidhi":

He's the owner of one of "Shiah al-Sittah" books and there isn't doubt about his reliability with Sunni.

2: Abd al-Jabbar ibn al-Ala':

He's one of the narrators of "Sahih Muslim". "Al-Dhahabi" says about him:

عبد الجبار بن العلاء بن عبد الجبار الإمام المحدث الثقة أبو بكر البصري

"Abd al-Jabbar ibn Ala' ibn abd al-Jabbar" is imam, hadith narrator and reliable...

"Al-Dhahabi" – Siyar al-A'lam al-Nubala – vol. 11, p 401

3: "Sufyan ibn Ayinah ibn abi Umran ibn Maymoun":

His narratives are written in all "Sihah Sitta" books. "Al-Dhahabi" says about him:

الإمام الكبير حافظ العصر شيخ الإسلام

Great imam, retentive of his age, Sheikh al-Islam and...

"Al-Dhahabi" – Siyar al-A'lam al-Nubala – vol. 8, p 454

4: "Asim ibn Buhdalah abi al-Najoud al-Asadi al-Kufi"

He's one of the narrators of "Sihah Sitta". "Al-Dhahabi" says that he was great imam:

“Al-Dhahabi” – Siyar al-A’lam al-Nubala – vol. 5, p 119

5: “Zakwan abu Salih al-Saman al-Ziyat al-Madani”:

He’s amongst narrators of “Sihah Sitta”. “Al-Dhahabi” says about him:

الغدوة الحافظ الحجة... ذكره الإمام أحمد فقال ثقة ثقة من أجل الناس وأوثقهم

Imam, hadith retentive, proof... imam “Ahmad” has remembered him and said: reliable, reliable. He’s amongst the most respectable people.

“Al-Dhahabi” – Siyar al-A’lam al-Nubala – vol. 5, p 36

6: “Abu Hurayrah”:

He’s amongst the most well-known sahaba and in Sunnis’ opinion he doesn’t need to be studied.

So, document of this narrative is impeccable.

2: “Ibn Athir Jazari”:

He’s also quoted narrative of “Abu Hurayrah” from “Sunan Tirmidhi” book:

“Ibn Athir Jazari” – Mu’jam al-Jami’ al-Usool fi ahadith al-Rasoul- vol. 10, p 330

3: “Jalal al-Din Suyuti”:

He’s quoted narrative of “Abu Hurayrah” that messenger of Allah [PBUH] said:

لَا تَذْهَبُ الدُّنْيَا وَلَا تَنْقُضِي حَتَّى يَمْلِكَ رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِيءُ اسْمَهُ اسْمِي.

“Al-Suyuti” – al-Jami’ al-Kabir – vol. 3, p 306 /// “Al-Suyuti” – Jami’ al-Ahadith – vol. 8, p 157

He’s quoted narrative of “Abu Hurayrah” in “Al-Fath al-Kabir” book, with this sentence:

يَلِي رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِيءُ اسْمَهُ اسْمِي لَوْ لَمْ يَتَّقَ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا إِلَّا يَوْمَ لَطَوَّلَ اللَّهُ.

"Al-Suyuti" – Al-Fath al-Kabir – vol. 3, p 307

4: "Ibn Kathir Damascene"

He's quoted narrative of "Abu Hurayrah" through "Abu Asim" who is amongst narrators of "Sahih Muslim" and "Sahih Bukhari" and says that it's authentic:

قال عاصم: وأخبرنا أبو عاصم عن أبي هريرة قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يلي الرجل من أهل بيتي يواطىء اسمه اسمي. هذا حديث حسن صحيح.

"Ibn Kathir Damascene" – Al-Nihayah fi al-Fitan wa al-Malahim - vol. 1, p 24

B: by "Ibn Masud"

This narrative has been quoted from "Ibn Masud" without this sentence at the end: "And his father's name is like my father's name" and Many of Sunni elders have quoted it in their books. This quotation has been done in two ways:

1: quoting by "Amr ibn Marrah" from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" from "Abdullah ibn Masud" with authentic document:

This quotation is written in two books and with two different documents but two similar texts without this extra sentence "And his father's name is like my father's name"

First quotation in "Al-Mu'jam al-Kabir" book:

حدثنا محمد بن السري بن مهران الناقد ثنا عبد الله بن عمر بن أبان ثنا يوسف بن حوشب الشيباني ثنا أبو يزيد الأعور عن عمرو بن مرة عن زر بن حبيش عن عبد الله بن مسعود قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم لا يذهب الدنيا حتي يملك رجل من أهل بيتي يوافق اسمه اسمي.

It's been quoted from "Abdullah ibn Masud" that messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: world isn't demolished until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me, rules.

"Tabarani" – al-Mu'jam al-Kabir – vol. 10, p 131

Studying document of the quotation:

Document of this narrative is as follow: {narrators}

1: "Tabarani" owner of al-Mu'jam al-Kabir:

There is consensus amongst Sunni scholars that he's reliable; "Al-Dhahabi" says about him:

٨٦ الطبراني هو الامام الحافظ الثقة الرجال الجوال محدث الاسلام علم المعمرين أبو القاسم سليمان بن أحمد بن ايوب بن مطير اللخمي الشامي الطبراني صاحب المعاجم الثلاثة

"Tabarani", imam, hadith retentive, reliable, Islam hadith narrator, he'd travel a lot and lived more than one hundred years... owner of three "Al-Mu'jam" book.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Siyar al-A'lam al-Nubala' - vol. 16, p 119

2: "Muhammad ibn Sari ibn Mahran":

He's reliable as well, "Al-Dhahabi" says about him:

محمد بن السري بن مهران الناقد. بغدادى، ثقة.

"Muhammad ibn Sari ibn Mahran" is specialist in "Rijal" science, reliable and from "Baghdad".

"Al-Dhahabi"- The History of Islam – vol. 22, p 269

3: "Abdullah ibn Amr ibn Aban":

"Al-Dhahabi" says that he's reliable:

مشكدانة المحدث الامام الثقة أبو عبد الرحمن عبد الله بن عمر بن محمد ابن ابان بن صالح بن عمير القرشي الاموي مولى عثمان رضى الله عنه.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Siyar al-A'lam al-Nubala – vol. 11, p 155

4: "Yususf ibn Hoshab":

"Ibn abi Hatim Razi" one of Sunni scholars says about him:

يوسف بن حوشب أخو العوام بن حوشب روي عن عبد الله بن سعيد بن أبي هند روي عنه عبد الله بن عمر بن أبان وأبو سعيد الأشج سمعت أبي يقول ذلك وسألته عنه فقال شيخ.

I asked my father about "Yusuf ibn Hoshab", he said that he's "Sheikh".

"Ibn abi Hatim" – al-Jarh wa al-Ta'dil – vol. 9, p 220

And Sunni scholars have said that in ibn abi Hatim's saying, "Sheikh" is amongst words that shows one's reliability, "Al-Dhahabi" says in this regard:

قول أبي حاتم شيخ قال وليس هذا بتضعيف قلت بل عده ابن أبي حاتم في مقدمة كتابه من ألقاظ التوثيق وكذا الخطيب البغدادي في الكفاية.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Mizan al-I'tidal – vol. 8, p 143

So, he's reliable amongst Sunni scholars.

5: "Khalf ibn Hoshab al-Kufi":

"Ibn Hajar Asqalani" says about him:

خلف بن حوشب الكوفي ثقة من السادسة مات بعد الأربعين خت عس.

"Al-Asqalani Shafi'i" – Taqrib al-Tahzib – vol. 1, p 194

6: "Amr ibn Marrah":

"Ibn Hajar" says about him:

عمر بن مرة الشني بفتح المعجمة وتشديد النون بصري مقبول من الرابعة د ت

"Al-Asqalani" – Taqrib al-Tahzib – vol. 1, p 417

7: "Zarr ibn Hubaysh:

"Ibn Hajar" says about him:

زر بكسر أوله وتشديد الراء بن حبيش بمهمله وموحدة ومعجمة مصغر بن حباشة بضم المهمله بعدها موحدة ثم معجمة الأسدي الكوفي أبو مريم ثقة جليل مخضرم مات سنة إحدى أو اثنتين أو ثلاث وثمانين وهو بن مائة وسبع وعشرين ع

“Al-Asqalani Shafi” – Taqri al-Tahzib” – vol. 1, p 215

8: “Abdullah ibn Masud”:

He’s one of sahib and in Sunni’s opinion he doesn’t need to be studied.

So, document of this narrative is authentic.

Second narration:

حدثنا أسلم قال ثنا محمد بن عبدالرحمن بن فهد بن هلال قال ثنا عبدالله بن علي السمسار قال ثنا يوسف بن حوشب قال ثنا أبو يزيد الأعور عن عمرو بن مرة عن زر بن حبيش عن عبدالله بن مسعود عن النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم قال لا تذهب الدنيا حتي يملك رجل من أهل بيتي يواطئ اسمه اسمي.

“Abdullah ibn Masud” has quoted from messenger of Allah [PBUH] who said: world won’t be destroyed until a man from my “Ahl al-Bayt” whose name is the same as me, rules.

“Al-Waseti” – Tarikh al-Waset – vol. 1, p 105

Of course, “Abdullah ibn Ali al-Samsar” is in the document of this narrative who is unknown but because document of last narrative was authentic, this document doesn’t need to be studied and confirms last narrative as well.

2: quotation by “Asim ibn Buhdalah” from “Zarr ibn Hubaysh” from “Abdullah ibn Masud”:

Despite of Sunni scholars have restated that document of this narrative is authentic, but as Sunni said, “Asim ibn Buhdalah” has sometimes quoted this narrative with extra and sometimes without it. Anyway, according to principles of Sunni scholars, the text of this narrative without extra is authentic and Shias can rely on it but the text with extra that has been quoted from “Zarr ibn Hubaysh” from “Ibn Masud” can’t be relied on because it narrator

{Asim ibn Buhdalah} is "Muztarab al-Hadith" {he's some times quoted it with extra and sometimes without it}.

1: "Ahmad ibn Hanbal":

He's the imam of "Hanbali" sect and has quoted five narratives without extra sentence {the name of his father is the same as my father's} through "Asim" and "Zarr ibn Jaysh" in his "Musnad" book and what interesting is that he's not even quoted one narrative which has this extra sentence and it proves that such narratives don't exist at all:

حدثنا عبد الله حدثني أبي ثنا سُفْيَانُ بن عُيَيْنَةَ ثنا عَاصِمٌ عن زر عن عبد الله عَنِ النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم: لَا تَقُومُ السَّاعَةُ حَتَّى يَلِي رَجُلٌ مِّنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يَواطِي اسْمُهُ اسْمِي.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: resurrection won't come until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me, rules.

"Ahmad ibn Hanbal" – Musnad – vol. 1, p 376

2: "Abu Dawud Sajestani":

He's quoted this narrative without extra sentence as well:

وقال في حديث سُفْيَانَ: لَا تَذْهَبُ أَوْ لَا تَنْقَضِي الدُّنْيَا حَتَّى يَمْلِكَ الْعَرَبَ رَجُلٌ مِّنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يَواطِيءُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: this world won't end until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me, owns "Arab".

"Al-Sajistani" – Sunan Abi Dawud – vol. 4, p 106

3: "Abu Isa Tirmidhi":

He's amongst great hadith narrators and is reliable with Sunni and has quoted two narratives which has only this sentence "his name is the same as me" at the end and says that both of them are authentic:

حدثنا عُبَيْدُ بنِ أَسْبَاطِ بنِ مُحَمَّدِ القُرَشِيِّ الكُوفِيُّ قال: حدثني أبي حدثنا سُفْيَانُ الثَّوْرِيُّ عن عَاصِمِ بنِ بَهْدَلَةَ عن زَرِّ عن عبد الله قال قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: لَا تَذْهَبُ الدُّنْيَا حتَّى يَمْلِكَ العَرَبَ رَجُلٌ من أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي.

قال أبو عيسى: وفي الباب عن عَلِيِّ وَأَبِي سَعِيدٍ وَأُمِّ سَلَمَةَ وَأَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ وَهَذَا حَدِيثٌ حَسَنٌ صَحِيحٌ.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: world won't end until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" whose name is the same as me, owns "Arab".

"Abu Isa" has said: there is narrative from "Ali", "Abu Saed", "Umm Salama" and "Abu Hurayrah" in this regard and this narrative is authentic.

Second narrative:

حدثنا عبد الجبار بن العلاء بن عبد الجبار العطار حدثنا سُفْيَانُ بنِ عُيَيْنَةَ عن عَاصِمِ عن زَرِّ عن عبد الله عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: يَلِي رَجُلٌ من أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي قال عَاصِمٌ وأنا أبو صالح عن أبي هُرَيْرَةَ قال: لو لم يبقَ من الدُّنْيَا إلا يَوْمٌ لَطَوَّلَ اللهُ ذلكَ اليَوْمَ حتَّى يَلِي.

After quoting narrative he says:

قال أبو عيسى: هذا حَدِيثٌ حَسَنٌ صَحِيحٌ.

"Al-Tirmidhi" – Sunan al-Tirmidhi – vol. 5, p 505

4: "Abu Saed A'rabi":

He's written one narrative without extra sentence quoted by "Asim" and "Zarr ibn Jaysh":

نا محمد، نا أبو الجواب، نا عمار بن رزيق، عن عاصم بن أبي النجود، عن زر، عن عبد الله بن مسعود قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: «لا تنقضي الدنيا حتى يلي من هذه الأمة رجل من أهل بيتي يواطئ اسمه اسمي»

"Abu Saed A'rabi" – Mu'jam al-A'rabi – vol. 2, p 290

5: "Ibn Habban Tamimy":

He's amongst Sunni well-known scholars and has quoted this narrative from "Asim" without extra:

وَحَدَّثَنَا الْفَضْلُ بْنُ الْحَبَابِ فِي عَقِبِهِ حَدَّثَنَا مُسَدَّدٌ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ إِبْرَاهِيمَ أَبُو شِهَابٍ حَدَّثَنَا عَاصِمُ بْنُ بَهْدَلَةَ عَنْ زُرِّ بْنِ أَبِي مَسْعُودٍ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: لَوْ لَمْ يَبْقَ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا إِلَّا لَيْلَةٌ لَمَلَكَ فِيهَا رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ بَيْتِي اسْمُهُ اسْمِي.

He's also quoted this narrative from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh":

أَخْبَرَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ أَحْمَدَ بْنِ أَبِي عَوْنٍ الرَّيَّانِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ الْمُنْذِرِ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ فَضَيْلٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عُثْمَانُ بْنُ شُبْرَمَةَ عَنْ عَاصِمِ بْنِ أَبِي النَّجُودِ عَنْ زُرِّ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ قَالَ: قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: يَخْرُجُ رَجُلٌ مِنْ أُمَّتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي وَخَلْفُهُ خَلْقِي فَيَمْلَأُهَا قِسْطًا وَعَدْلًا كَمَا مَلِئْتُ ظُلْمًا وَجَوْرًا.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: a man from my nation whose name is the same as me will appear and fill the world with justice as it's filled with oppression.

"Ibn Habban" – Sahih ibn Habban – vol. 15, p 237

3: quoted by "Huzayfah ibn Yaman":

"Huzayfah" is one of the companions of messenger of Allah [PBUH] and has quoted this narrative without this sentence "the name of his father is the same as my father's":

1: "Maqdasi Shafi'i"

وعن حذيفة رضي الله عنه قال: خطبنا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم فذكرنا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم بما هو كائن، ثم قال: لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله عز وجل ذلك اليوم، حتى يبعث في رجلاً من ولدي اسمه اسمي. فقام سلمان الفارسي رضي الله عنه فقال: يا رسول الله، من أي ولدك؟ قال: هو من ولدي هذا، وضرب بيده علي الحسين عليه السلام.

أخرجه الحافظ أبو نعيم، في صفة المهدي.

"Huzayfah" says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] delivered sermon and told us about what is going happen in future and said: if only one day left from the world, god will make it so long until a

man from my children whose name is the same as me, appears on that day and said that he's from the descendent of this child of mine while he was hitting on Husain's shoulder. "Abu Na'im Isfahani" has said this narrative in his book called "Siffat al-Huda".

"Al-Maqdasi Shafi'" – Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazar – vol. 1, p 82

2: "Muhib al-Din Tabari":

He's quoted this narrative through "Huzayfah" without extra sentence:

عن حذيفة أن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يبعث رجلا من ولدي اسمه كاسمي فقال سلمان: من أي ولدك يا رسول الله؟ قال: من ولدي هذا وضرب بيده علي الحسين.

"Huzayfah" says: messenger of Allah said [PBUH]: if only one day left from this world, god will make it so long until a man from my children whose name is the same as me, appears. "Salman" said: from which one of your children? Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] said: from the descendent of this child of mine and hit his hand on Husain's shoulder.

"Al-Tabari" – Zakhi'r al-Uqba – vol. 1, p 136

This narrative has been accepted by "Tabari"; because before this narrative, he's quoted other narratives which say: "Mahdi" is from the child of "Fatimah" [a.s]. After quoting this narrative "Tabari" says:

فيحمل ما ورد مطلقا فيما تقدم علي هذا المقيد.

Those general narratives that already said are bound up by this narrative. Thus, "Mahdi" is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [a.s].

"Al-Tabari" – Zakha'ir al-Uqba – vol. 1, p 137

3: "Muhammad ibn abi Bakr al-Hanbali":

وقال الطبراني حدثنا محمد بن زكريا الهلالي حدثنا العباس ابن بكار حدثنا عبد الله بن زياد عن الأعمش عن زر بن حبيش عن حذيفة قال خطبنا النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم فذكر ما هو

كائن ثم قال لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يبعث رجلا من ولدي اسمه اسمي ولكن هذا إسناد ضعيف.

“Muhammad ibn Abi Bakr al-Hanbali” – al-Minar al-Manif – vol. 1, p 148

4: “Jalal al-Din Suyuti”:

He’s amongst well-known Sunni hadith narrators and interpreters and has quoted narrative of “Huzayfah” through “Abu Na’im” as well.

“Al-Suyuti” – al-Hawi al-Fatawa – vol. 2, p 60

4: quoted by “Abdullah ibn Umar”:

“Abdullah ibn Umar”, son of the second caliph- is one of guys who have quoted narrative of messenger of Allah [PBUH] without that extra sentence.

“Maqdasi Shafi’i” has written narrative of “Abdullah ibn Umar” in his book:

وعن عبد الله بن عمر، رضي الله عنهما قال: قال رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم: يخرج في آخر الزمان رجل من ولدي، اسمه كاسمي، وكنيته ككنيتي، يملأ الأرض عدلاً، كما ملئت جوراً.

“Abdullah ibn Umar” says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: a man from my children whose name and nickname are the same as me will appear and fill the world with justice as it’s filled with oppression.

“Al-Maqdasi Shafi’i” – Aqd al-Durar fi Akhbar al-Muntazar – vol. 1, p 95

5: Quoted by “Ibn Abbas”:

He’s one of sahaba of messenger of Allah [PBUH]. “Zarr ibn Jaysh” has also quoted this narrative from him without this extra sentence: “And name of his father is the same as my father’s”. Many Sunni scholars have said this narrative in their books. “Abu Saed Shashi” one the hadith narrators has said:

حدثنا ابن أبي خيثمة نا يعقوب بن كعب الأنطاكي نا أبي عن عبد الملك بن أبي غنية عن عاصم عن زر عن ابن عباس قال قال رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم: لا تنقضي الدنيا حتي بيعت الله رجلا من أمتي يواطى اسمه اسمي.

“Ibn Abbas” says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: world won’t end until a man from my nation whose name is the same as me, appears.

“Al-Shashi” – Musnad al-Shashi – vol. 2, p 111

“Sa’d al-Din Taftazani”, one of Sunni scholars says: “authentic narratives have been quoted about hadrat “Mahdi” [a.s] rising”. He quotes narrative of “Ibn Abbas”:

خاتمة مما يلحق باب الإمامة بحث خروج المهدي ونزول عيسي صلي الله عليه وسلم وهما من أشراط الساعة وقد وردت في هذا الباب أخبار صحاح وإن كانت أحادا ويشبه أن يكون حديث خروج الدجال متواتر المعني أما خروج المهدي فعن ابن عباس رضي تعالي عنه أنه قال قال رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم لا تذهب الدنيا حتي يملك العرب رجل من أهل بيتي يواطىء اسمه اسمي.

What is related to chapter of imamate is the matter of appearance of “Mahdi” and hadrat “Jesus” descent and these two are amongst signs of resurrection that authentic narratives were quoted in this regard. Narratives regarding “Dajjal” rising are successive in terms of meaning. But as for appearance of “Mahdi”, “Ibn Abbas” has quoted from messenger of Allah [PBUH] who said: world won’t come to an end until a man from my “Ahl al-Bayt” owns “Arab”.

“Sa’d al-Din Taftazani” – Sharh al-Maqasid – vol. 2, p 307

6: Quoted by “Abu Saed Khederi”:

He’s quoted narrative of messenger of Allah [PBUH] without this extra sentence “And his father’s name is the same as my father’s”.

“Ibn Himad” quotes this narrative from “Abu Saed Khederi”:

حدثنا الوليد عن أبي رافع عن عمه عن أبي سعيد الخدري رضي الله عنه عن النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم قال اسم المهدي اسمي.

“Ibn Himad” – Kitab al-Fitan – vol. 1, p 368

7: Quoted by commander of the faithful Ali [a.s]:

1: “Ibn Dawud Sajestani” in “Sunan”:

“Abu Dawud” quotes a narrative from commander of the faithful Ali [a.s] {there is different about document of this narrative} in his “Al-Sunan” book:

قال أبو داؤد حَدَّثْتُ عَنْ هَارُونَ بْنِ الْمُغْبِرَةِ قَالَ ثنا عَمْرُو بْنُ أَبِي قَيْسٍ عَنْ شُعَيْبِ بْنِ خَالِدٍ عَنْ أَبِي إِسْحَاقَ قَالَ قَالَ عَلِيٌّ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ وَنَظَرَ إِلَيَّ ابْنَةُ الْحَسَنِ فَقَالَ إِنَّ ابْنِي هَذَا سَيِّدٌ كَمَا سَمَّاهُ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَسَيَخْرُجُ مِنْ صُلْبِهِ رَجُلٌ يُسَمَّى بِاسْمِ نَبِيِّكُمْ يُشْبِهُهُ فِي الْخُلُقِ وَلَا يُشْبِهُهُ فِي الْخَلْقِ ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ قِصَّةَ يَمَلَأُ الْأَرْضَ عَدْلًا

Commander of the faithful [a.s] looked at his son “Hassan” and said: my son is master as Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] gave him such title and there will be man from his descendent whose name is the same as Messenger of Allah [PBUH] and his behavior is like him but his appearance is different than him, then he said a story and said: he’ll fill the earth with justice!

“Al-Sajestani” – Sunan – vol. 4, p 108

2: “Na’im ibn Hemad”:

He quotes in his “Al-Fitan” book that hadrat “Ali” [a.s] said:

حدثنا غير واحد عن ابن عياش عن حدثه عن محمد بن جعفر عن علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله عنه قال سمي النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم الحسن سيدا وسيخرج من صلبه رجل اسمه اسم نبيكم يملأ الأرض عدلا كما ملئت جورا.

“Naim ibn Hemad” – kitab al-Fitan – vol. 1, p 374

Result of first part:

Narrative that has been quoted from messenger of Allah [PBUH] about hadrat Mahdi’s [a.s] name and agrees with Shias’ opinion – without this extra sentence “and his father’s name is the same as my father’s”- has also been quoted in Sunni resources through different persons

and as Sunni scholars have admitted and according to their principles document of messenger of Allah's [PBUH] narrative that reaches to "Abu Hurayrah" and the document that reaches to "Abdullah ibn Masud" quoted by "Amr ibn Marrah", are authentic. The same goes for the document of narrative that reaches to "Abdullah ibn Masud" quoted by "Asim ibn Buhdalah" is authentic but "Asim" is "Muztarab al-Hadith" {he's sometimes quoted this hadith with extra and sometimes without it}.

And other quotations confirm this narrative. Thus, this group of narratives that doesn't have this extra sentence "and name of his father is the same as ma father's", is emphasized and has been quoted in successive way.

So, this saying of what "Ibn Taymiyah" and his followers that Shias have deleted this extra sentence from the end of the narrative messenger of Allah [PBUH] and have distorted it, only shows that they don't know what's written in Sunni books and their own resources or they try to hide the truth.

Second part: Sunni narratives with extra sentence "And his father's name is the same as my father's name"

1: studying document of these narratives:

First group of narratives were narratives without this extra sentence at the end "and his father's name is the same as my father's name", it was proved that according to Sunni principles their document is authentic and even reaches to successive.

But second group of narratives that have been relied on against Shia are mostly invalid and have no value that we study their document:

1: quoted by "Tamim Dari" from messenger of Allah [PBUH]:

"Ibn Habban" quotes this narrative in his book:

(عبد الله بن السري المدائني) روي عن أبي عمران الجوني عن مجالد بن سعيد عن الشعبي عن تميم الداري قال: قلت يا رسول الله رأيت للروم مدينة يقال لها أنطاكية ما رأيت أكثر مطرا منها فقال النبي(ص): نعم وذلك أن فيها التوراة وعصا موسى ورضراض الألواح وسرير

سليمان بن داود في غار... فلا تذهب الأيام ولا الليالي حتي يسكنها رجل من عترتي اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه يشبه خلقه لخلقى وخلقه خلقى يملأ الدنيا قسطا وعدلا كما ملئت ظلما وجورا.

"Tamim Dari" says: I said to messenger of Allah [PBUH]: I saw a city in "Roma" called "Al-Takiyah" that rains a lot. messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: Yes, it does. "Torah", staff of "Moses", pieces of tablets and "Solomon" throne are in there cave.... Days and nights wouldn't pass until a man from my "Ahl al-Bayt" resides there. His name is the same as me and his father's name is like my father's name and he's similar to me in creation and attitude and will fill the earth with justice as it's filled with oppression.

"Ibn Habban" – Al-Majrouhin men al-Muhaddithin – vol. 2, p 34

"Ibn Habban" and other Sunni scholars admit that this narrative is faked:

Before quoting above narrative from "Tamim Dari", "Ibn Habban" says about "Abdullah Siri": he quotes weird narratives from "Abu Umran Jouni" which are faked and quoting them isn't permissible:

عبد الله بن السري المدائني شيخ يروي عن أبي عمران الجوني العجائب التي لا يشك من هذا الشأن صناعته أنها موضوعة لا يحل ذكره في الكتب إلا علي سبيل الإنباه عن أمره لمن لا يعرفه، روي عن أبي عمران الجوني عن مجالد بن سعيد عن الشعبي عن تميم الداري قال:... حتي يسكنها رجل من عترتي اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي....

"Abdullah ibn Siri Mada'ini" is a sheikh who has quoted strange things from "Abi Umran Jouni" that have certainly faked by himself and quoting these narratives in books isn't permissible; unless quoting them make others to understand who he is. Then he quotes above narrative...

"Ibn Habban" – al-Majrouhin men al-Muhaddithin – vol. 2, p 34

Before quoting this narrative from "Tamim Dari", "Shams al-Din al-Dhahabi" and "Jalal al-Din Suyuti" say about him the same thing that "Ibn Habban" said:

قال ابن حبان: عبد الله يروي عن أبي عمران الجوني العجائب التي لا تشك أنها موضوعة.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Mizan al-I'tidal – vol. 4, p 106

"Abu al-Faraj ibn al-Jawzi" says about this narrative:

هذا حديث لا يصح عن رسول الله.

It's not true that this narrative was said by messenger of Allah [PBUH].

"Ibn al-Jawzi" – al-Mozoua't – vol. 1, p 362

2: quoted by "Qurrah ibn Iyas al-Mazani" from messenger of Allah [PBUH]:

One of those who have quoted this narrative is "Muawiyah ibn Qurrah" who has quoted it from his father. "Ibn Asakir" and "Tabari" have reported it as follow:

حدثنا محمد بن عبدوس بن كامل السراج ثنا أحمد بن محمد بن يزيد ح وحدثنا أحمد بن محمد بن صدقة ثنا محمد بن يحيى الأزدي قال ثنا داود بن المحبر بن قحدم حدثني أبي المحبر بن قحدم عن معاوية بن قرة عن أبيه قال: قال رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم: لتملأن الأرض ظلماً وجوراً كما ملئت قسطاً وعدلاً حتى يبغث الله رجلاً مني اسمه اسمي وأسم أبيه اسم أبي فيملأها قسطاً وعدلاً كما ملئت ظلماً وجوراً يلبث فيكم سبعا أو ثمانيا فإن كثر فتسعا لا تمنع السماء قطرها ولا الأرض شيئا من نباتها.

"Muawiyah ibn Qurrah" has quoted from his father that messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: indeed, earth will be filled with oppression as it's filled with justice, then a man from my dynasty whose name is the same as me and his father's name is like my father's name, will appear and fill the earth with justice as it's filled with oppression. He'll stay amongst you seven to eight years or more, sky won't withdraw its rain and earth won't withdraw its plants.

"Al-Tabarani" – al-Mu'jam al-Kabir – vol. 19, p 32 /// "Ibn Asakir" – The history of Damascus – vol. 49, p 296

Confession of Sunni scholars to the invalidity of this narrative:

After quoting this narrative in "Feiz al-Qadir" book, "Al-Manawi" says:

لتملأن الأرض جورا وظلما الجور الظلم يقال جار في حكمه جورا إذا ظلم فجمع بينهما إشارة إلي أنه ظلم بالغ مضاعف فإذا ملئت جورا وظلما بيعت الله رجلا مني أي من أهل بيتي اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي فيملؤها عدلا وقسطا العدل خلاف الجور وكذا القسط وجمع بينهما لمثل ما تقدم في ضده كما ملئت جورا وظلما فلا تمنع السماء شيئا من قطرها ولا الأرض شيئا من نباتها يمكث فيكم سبعا أو ثمانيا فإن أكثر فتسعا يعني من السنين وهذا هو المهدي المنتظر خروجه آخر الزمان البزار طب وكذا في الأوسط عن قرة بن إياس المزني بضم الميم وفتح الزاي قال الهيثمي رواه من طريق داود بن المحبر عن أبيه وكلاهما ضعيف

“Haythami” says that he’s quoted this narrative from “Dawud ibn Muhbar” and him from his father and both of them aren’t reliable!

“Al-Manawi” – Faiz al-Qadir – vol. 5, p 262

3: quoted by “Abu Tufayl” from messenger of Allah [PBUH]:

One of those who have quoted this narrative is “Abu Tufayl”, but there is fault in the document of this narrative:

“Ibn Himad” has reported this narrative with this document:

حدثنا الوليد ورشدين عن ابن لهيعة عن إسرائيل بن عباد عن ميمون القداح عن أبي الطفيل رضي الله عنه أن رسول الله (ص) قال: المهدي اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي.

“Abu Tufayl” has been quoted that messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: Mahdi’s name is the same as me and name of his father is my father’s name.

“Na’im ibn Himad” – Kitab al-Fitan – vol. 1, p 368

Document of this narrative is invalid; because there are narrators in its document who are known unreliable by Sunni scholars of “Rijal” science and some of them are unknown. So, this narrative is invalid and couldn’t be relied on:

1: “Abdullah ibn Lahi’ah”:

“Al-Dhahabi” says about him:

عبد الله بن لهيعة أبو عبد الرحمن الحضرمي... ضعف... قلت العمل علي تضعيف حديثه توفي
١٧٤ د ت ق

"Abdullah ibn Lahi'ah"... is unreliable and narratives quote by him are invalid.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Al-Kashif – vol. 1, p 2929

2: "Maymoun Qaddah":

His full name is "Maymoun ibn Dawud ibn Saed ibn Qaddah" and Sunni scholars of "Rijal" science haven't written his biography and he's unknown for them, but "Khair al-Din Zirkili" says that he's amongst leaders of "Isma'iliyah" sect and says that he would pretend to be Shia but in fact, he was infidel:

ميمون بن داود بن سعيد، القداح: رأس الفرقة (الميمونية) من الإسماعيلية. في نسبه وسيرته اضطراب، قيل: اسم أبيه ديسان، أو غيلان. وفي الإسماعيلية من ينسبه إلي سلمان الفارسي. كان يظهر التشيع ويبطن الزندقة. ولد بمكة وانتقل إلي الاهواز. واتصل بمحمد الباقر وابنه جعفر الصادق. روي عنهما. ويقال: إنه أدرك محمد ابن إسماعيل بن جعفر، وأدبه ولقنه مذهب الباطنية.

"Al-Zirkili" – al-A'lam – vol. 7, p 341

4: quoted by "Abdullah ibn Masud" from messenger of Allah [PBUH]:

One those who is in the document of this narrative is "Abdullah ibn Masud", one of the companions of Prophet Muhammad [PBUH], this narrative has been quoted from him in two ways:

1: first quotation: "Hakim Nishapuri" has quoted in "Al-Mustadrak" book from "Alqama ibn Qais" and "Ubaydah Salmani" from "Abdullah Ibn Masud":

First quotation is written in "Al-Mustadrak" book:

أخبرني أبو بكر بن دارم الحافظ بالكوفة ثنا محمد بن عثمان بن سعيد القرشي ثنا يزيد بن محمد الثقفي ثنا حبان بن سدير عن عمرو بن قيس الملائي عن الحكم عن إبراهيم عن علقمة بن قيس وعبيدة السلماني عن عبد الله بن مسعود رضي الله عنه قال أتينا رسول الله

صلي الله عليه وسلم فخرج إلينا مستبشرا يعرف السرور في وجهه فما سألناه عن شيء إلا أخبرنا به ولا سكتنا إلا إبتدأنا حتي مرت فتية من بني هاشم فيهم الحسن والحسين فلما رأهم التزمهم وانهملت عيناه فقلنا يا رسول الله ما نزال نري في وجهك شيئا نكرهه فقال إنا أهل بيت اختار الله لنا الآخرة علي الدنيا وأنه سيلقي أهل بيتي من بعدي تطريدا وتشريدا في البلاد حتي ترتفع رايات سود من المشرق فيسألون الحق فلا يعطونه ثم يسألونه فلا يعطونه ثم يسألونه فلا يعطونه فيقاتلون فينصرون فمن أدركه منكم أو من أعقابكم فليأت إمام أهل بيتي ولو حبوا علي الثلج فإنها رايات هدي يدفعونها إلي رجل من أهل بيتي يواطئ اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي فيملك الأرض فيملأها قسطا وعدلا كما ملئت جورا وظلما.

“Abdullah ibn Masud” has been quoted that we went to messenger of Allah [PBUH], he came out happily and answered any question that we asked him and whenever we remained silent, he broke out conversation until a group of “Bani Hashim” youth including “Hassan” and “Husain” was passing by, after seeing them, messenger of Allah [PBUH] accompanied them with tearful eyes! We told him: O messenger of Allah [PBUH]! We see something on your face that upsets us! He said: we’re dynasty that god has preferred hereafter to world for us and after me, my “Ahl al-Bayt” will see homelessness and loneliness in their homeland until black flags appear from east, they demand right, but they’re not given. They demand again but they’re not given, they demand for the third time, but they’re not given and they will fight and win. Each of you or your descendent that see that day shall come to the imam of my “Ahl al-Bayt” even if he has to crawl on snow, because they’re guidance flags which will be given to one of my “Ahl al-Bayt” whose name is the same as me and his father’s name is like my father’s name, he’ll own the earth and fill it with justice as it’s filled with oppression.

“Al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn” – vol. 4, p 511

Studying document of this narrative:

There are several faults in the document of this narrative:

1: “Ahmad ibn Muhammad ibn al-Siri ibn Yahya ibn abi Darim” is in its document who is known as liar by Sunni scholars:

“Al-Dhahabi” says about him:

أحمد بن محمد بن السري بن يحيى بن أبي دارم المحدث أبو بكر الكوفي الرافضي الكذاب مات في اول سنة سبع وخمسين وثلاثمائة وقيل انه لحق إبراهيم القصار حدث عن أحمد بن موسى والحمار وموسي بن هارون وعدة روي عنه الحاكم وقال رافضي غير ثقة

"Hakim Nishapuri" has quoted narrative from him and said that he's "Rāfiḍī" and unreliable.

"Al-Dhahabi" – Mizan al-I'tidal – vol. 1, p 283

2: "Muhammad ibn Uthman ibn Saed" is in the document of this narrative and he's unknown:

And... that's why even "Hakim Nishapuri" hasn't said that this narrative is authentic.

2 second quotation: from "Asim" from "Zarr ibn Hubaish" from "Abdullah ibn Masud":

This quotation has numerous contents that we'll mention them:

First content:

حدثنا ابن عيينة عن عاصم عن زر عن عبد الله عن النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم قال: المهدي يواطئ اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي.

"Ibn Masud" says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: Mahdi's name is my name and his father's name is like my father's name.

Notable point in this reporting is that after quoting this narrative "Ibn Himad" says:

وسمعه غير مرة لا يذكر اسم أبيه.

I've heard this narrative without this sentence "and his father's name is the same as my father's name", several times.

"Na'im ibn Himad" – Kitab al-Fetan – vol. 1, p 367

Second content:

حدثنا الْقَضْلُ بن دُكَيْنٍ قال: حدثنا فِطْرٌ عن عاصم عن زِرِّ عن عبد الله قال: قال رسول الله (ص): لَا تَذْهَبُ الدُّنْيَا حتَّى يَبْعَثَ اللهُ رَجُلًا من أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي وَاسْمُ أَبِيهِ اسْمَ أَبِي.

“Abdullah ibn Masud” says: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: world won't come to an end until a man from my “ahl al Bayt” whose name is my name and his father's name is the same as father's name, appears

“Ibn abi Shaybah” – al-Musannaf – vol. 7, p 513 /// “al-Tabarani” – al-Mu'jam al-Kabir – vol. 10, p 133 /// “Hakim Nishapuri” – al-Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihayn – vol. 4, p 488

Third content:

حدثنا الْعَبَّاسُ بن مُحَمَّدٍ الْمُجَاشِعِيُّ الْأَصْبَهَانِيُّ ثنا محمد بن أبي يَعْقُوبَ الْكِرْمَانِيُّ ثنا عُبَيْدُ اللهِ بن مُوسَى عن زَائِدَةَ عن عَاصِمٍ عن زِرِّ عن عبد الله قال: قال رسول الله صلي الله عليه وسلم: لو لم يَبْقَ مِنَ الدُّنْيَا إِلَّا يَوْمٌ لَطَوَّلَ اللهُ ذلكَ الْيَوْمَ حتَّى يَبْعَثَ اللهُ فيه رَجُلًا مِنِّي أو من أَهْلِي أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يَواطِيءُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي وَاسْمُ أَبِيهِ اسْمَ أَبِي.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: if only one day left from this world, god will make it too long until a man from me or from my “Ahl al-Bayt” whose name is my name and his father's name is the same as my father's name, appears.

“Al-Sajestani” – Sunan ibn Dawud – vol. 4, p 106 /// “Al-Tabarani” – al-Mu'jam al-Kabir – vol. 10, p 135

Fourth content:

أَخْبَرَنَا الْحُسَيْنُ بنُ أَحْمَدَ بنِ بَسْطَامٍ بِالْأُبَلَّةِ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَمْرُو بنُ عَلِيٍّ بنِ بَحْرِ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ مَهْدِيٍّ عَنْ سَغْيَانَ عَنْ عَاصِمٍ عَنْ زِرِّ عَنْ عَبْدِ اللهِ قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللهِ صلي الله عليه وسلم: لَا تَقُومُ السَّاعَةُ حتَّى يَمْلِكَ النَّاسَ رَجُلٌ من أَهْلِ بَيْتِي يُوَاطِئُ اسْمُهُ اسْمِي وَاسْمُ أَبِيهِ اسْمَ أَبِي فَيَمْلُؤُهَا قِسْطًا وَعَدْلًا.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: resurrection won't be set up until a man whose name is my name and his father's name is my father's owns people's affairs. He'll fill the earth with justice.

"Ibn Habban" – Sahih – vol. 15, p 236 /// "Albani" – al-Sunan – vol. 5, p 1042

Studying quotation of "Asim" from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" from "Abdullah ibn Masud":

That's true that most of narrators of this narrative are narrators of "Sahih Bukhari" and "Sahih Muslim", but there is fault in its document; because "Asim" has had poor memory and was the enemy of hadrta "Ali" [a.s], and in high probability fault of this document returns to him, because this quotation of him from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" from "Abdullah ibn Masud" has been quoted without this extra sentence "And his father's name is like my father's name" and even some of those who have quoted this extra sentence from "Asim" have realized that he's "Muztarab al-Hadith" {he's quoted the same narrative deifferently}. "Ibn Haja Asqalani" writes about him:

عاصم بن بهدلة وهو بن أبي النجود الأسدي... قال بن سعد كان ثقة إلا أنه كان كثير الخطأ في حديثه... وقال يعقوب بن سفيان في حديثه اضطراب وهو ثقة... وقد تكلم فيه بن علي فقال كان كل من اسمه عاصم سيء الحفظ... وقال بن خراش في حديثه نكرة وقال العقيلي لم يكن فيه إلا سوء الحفظ وقال الدارقطني في حفظه شيء... وقال بن قانع قال حماد بن سلمة خلط عاصم في آخر عمره... وقال العجلي كان عثمانيا .

"Asim ibn Buhdala"... "Ibn Sa'd" has said that he's reliable but makes mistake in quoting narratives... "Ya'qub ibn Sufyan" has said that he's "Muztarab al-Hadith" {he's quoted the same narrative differently} but he's honest... "Ibn Alaih" has said about him: anyone whose name was "Asim", was poor in memorizing narratives... and "Aqili" and "Dar Qatni" say that he's only problem was that he was poor in memorizing and "Ejli" says that he was "Ottoman".

"Al-Asqalani"- Tahzib al-Tahzib – vol. 5, p 67

Notable point about him is that he was "Ottoman" and all of Ottomans would consider enemy of commander of the faithful Ali [a.s]. if there isn't any other reason rejecting his narrative, this point is enough rejecting it.

The result of studying document of narratives:

Narrative with this sentence "his father's name is like my father's name" at the end were quoted through four persons in Sunni resources that document of three of these quotations are certainly invalid and fourth quotation by "Asim ibn Buhdalah" from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" from "Ibn Masud" has some faults that return to its main narrators "Asim ibn Buhdalah". For instance; he was the enemy of "Ali ibn abi Talib" [a.s] and was "Muztarab al-Hadith" and had poor memory. So, he's quotation can't be relied on.

On the other hand, this narrative has been quoted by "Amr ibn Marrah" from "Zarr ibn Jaysh" from "Ibn Masud" without extra sentence with authentic document and this narrative has also been quoted from "Abu Hurayrah" without extra sentence with authentic document.

And this narrative has been quoted by "Asim ibn Buhdalah" from "Zarr ibn Jaysh" from "Ibn Masud" without this extra sentence. And even if document of this quotation is invalid because "Asim ibn Buhdalah" is "Muztarab al-Hadith" {quoting the same narrative differently}, this narrative has been quoted by "Abu Hurayrah" without extra sentence.

2: Sunni scholars have confessed that this sentence "his father's name is like my father's name" is void or faked.

As it was said in second part, narratives with extra sentence aren't don't have authentic document, but if any of Sunni scholars have said that this extra sentence is faked or void? Answer is written in the book of three of Sunni scholars:

1: Allameh "Kanji Shafi'i":

He says:

و جمع الحافظ أبو نعيم طرق هذا الحديث عن الجرم الغفير في (مناقب المهدي) كلهم عن عاصم بن أبي النجود عن زر عن عبد الله عن النبي صلى الله عليه وآله.

"Abu Na'im" has quoted documents of this narrative from numerous persons in "virtues of Mahdi" book that all of them have quoted this narrative from "Asim ibn Buhdalah" from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" from "Abdullah ibn Masud" {with or without extra sentence}.

After quoting this narrative from thirty one narrators, he says:

ورواه غير عاصم عن زر وهو عمرو بن مرة عن زر، كل هؤلاء رووا (اسمه اسمي) إلا ما كان من عبيد الله بن موسى عن زائدة عن عاصم فإنه قال فيه (واسم أبيه اسم أبي). ولا يرتاب اللبيب أن هذه الزيادة لا اعتبار بها مع اجتماع هؤلاء الأئمة علي خلافها، والله أعلم.

... except "Asim ibn Buhdalah" who has quoted this narrative from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh", "Amr ibn Marrah" has quoted it from "Zarr ibn Hubaysh" as well. All these narrators have quoted this narrative with this sentence "His name is the same as me", unless narrative that has been quoted by "Ubayd Allah ibn Musa" from "Za'idah" from "Asim" which has been quoted with this extra sentence "and his father's name is like my father's name". No wise person doubts that this sentence is extra and since there is consensus amongst these narrators against what he's quoted, his narrative isn't authentic.

"Al-Kanji Shafi'i" – Al-Bayan fi Akhbar Sahib al-Zaman" – p 483

2: "Rabi' Muhammad ibn Al-Saudi":

He's a Wahhabi author and quotes this narrative in his book:"

"لو لم يبق من الدنيا إلا يوم واحد لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يعث الله فيه رجلاً من اهل بيتي يواطئ اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم ابي"

Then he says:

ولا ريب أنّ هذا قد وضعه اصحاب محمد بن عبد الله النفس الزكية، فاتّه كان معروفاً بكونه المهدي.

There is no doubt that this narrative was faked by followers of "Muhammad ibn Abdullah al-Nafs al-Zakiyah"; because he was known as promised "Mahdi".

"Rabi' ibn Muhammad al-Saudi" – al-Shia al-Imamiyah fi Mizan al-Islam – p 307

3: "Sa'd Muhammad Hassan", master of "Al-Azhar" university:

He says in his book that narratives with this extra sentence "his father's name is like my father's name" are faked:

“أحاديث (اسم أبيه اسم أبي) أحاديث موضوعة، ولكن الطريف في تصريحه أنه نسب الوضع إلى الشيعة الإمامية لتؤيد بها وجهة نظرها علي حد تعبيره”

Narratives with this sentence "his father's name is like father's name" are faked and what interesting is that {Ibn Taymiyyah} says clearly that Shias have faked narratives without this extra sentence to justify his own opinion!

What is the target of faking this extra sentence?

One of issues written in Shia and Sunni books is that this sentence "His father's name is the same as my father's name" has been faked by the claimants of "Mahdaviat". According to narrative and historical resources, many were called promised "Mahdi" that some of them, themselves did so and some other were known amongst people with this title such as; "Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn al-Hassan" known as "Hasan al-Muthanna" and "Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn al-Mansur", one of "Abbasid" caliphs. Their name is "Muhammad ibn Abdullah". Shia and Sunni elders and scholars have said that this extra sentence was faked for of them:

1: "Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn Hasan"

It's written in historical resources that "Abdullah ibn Hasan" claimed that his son "Muhammad" is promised "Mahdi":

As it was said, Wahhabi scholar "Rabi' ibn Muhammad al-Saudi" says in this regard:

ولا ريب أنّ هذا قد وضعه اصحاب محمد بن عبد الله النفس الزكية، فانه كان معروفا بكونه المهدي.

Undoubtedly, this narrative has been faked by followers of "Muhammad ibn Abdullah Nafs al-Zakiyah", because he was known as promised "Mahdi".

"Al-Sheikh Rabi' ibn Muhamamd al-Saudi" – Al-Shia Imamiyah fi Mizan al-Islam – p 307

And "Muhammad ibn Ali ibn Tabatab" known as "Ibn Taqqati", one of scholars of genealogy science says:

كان النفس الزكية من سادات بني هاشم ورجالهم فضلاً وشرفاً ودينياً وعلماً وشجاعة وفصاحة ورياسة وكرامة ونبلاً. وكان في ابتداء الأمر قد شيع بين الناس أنه المهدي الذي بشر به، وأثبت أبوه هذا في نفوس طوائف من الناس. وكان يروي أن الرسول، صلوات الله عليه وسلامه، قال: لو بقي من الدنيا يوم لطول الله ذلك اليوم حتي يبعث فيه مهدينا أو قائمنا، اسمه كاسمي واسم أبيه كاسم أبي. فأما الإمامية فيروون هذا الحديث خالياً من: واسم أبيه كاسم أبي.

فكان عبد الله المحض يقول للناس عن ابنه محمد: هذا هو المهدي الذي بشر به، هذا محمد بن عبد الله....

"Nafs al-Zakiyah" was one of the big men of "Bani Hashim" in terms of dignity, excellence, knowledge, bravery, eloquence, benevolence and presidency. And in the beginning, there was rumor amongst people that he's promised "Mahdi" and his father had made people thinking so and would quote that Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] has said: if only one day left from the world, god will make it so long until our "Mahdi" whose name is my name and his father's name is like father's name, rises. But Shias who believe in twelve imams have quoted this narrative without this sentence "his father's name is the same as my father's name".

"Abdullah ibn Mahz" {father of Nafs al-Zakiyah} would say to people: my son is promised "Mahdi", he's that "Muhammad ibn Abdullah".

"Al-Taqqati" – Al-Fakhri fi Adab al-Sultaniyah – vol. 1, p 61

"Abu al-Farj Isfahani" has reported that a group of "Bani Hashim" gathered up and "Abdullah ibn al-Hasan" introduced his son as promised "Mahdi":

أَنَّ جَمَاعَةً مِنْ بَنِي هَاشِمٍ اجْتَمَعُوا بِالْأَبْوَاءِ وَفِيهِمْ إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلِيِّ بْنِ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الْعَبَّاسِ وَأَبُو جَعْفَرِ الْمَنْصُورِ وَصَالِحُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ وَعَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ الْحَسَنِ وَابْنَاهُ مُحَمَّدٌ وَإِبْرَاهِيمُ وَمُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ عَمْرٍو بْنِ عُثْمَانَ فَقَالَ صَالِحُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ...

فَحَمِدَ اللَّهُ عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنِ الْحَسَنِ وَأَتْنِي عَلَيْهِ ثُمَّ قَالَ قَدْ عَلِمْتُمْ أَنَّ ابْنِي هَذَا هُوَ الْمَهْدِيُّ فَهَلُمَّ
فَلْتَبَايَعُوهُ. قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ لِأَيِّ شَيْءٍ تَخَدَعُونَ أَنْفُسَكُمْ وَاللَّهِ لَقَدْ عَلِمْتُمْ مَا النَّاسُ إِلَيَّ أَحَدٍ أَصَوَرَ
أَعْنَاقًا وَلَا أَسْرَعَ إِجَابَةً مِنْهُمْ إِلَيَّ هَذَا الْفَتَى يُرِيدُ بِهِ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ. قَالُوا قَدْ وَاللَّهِ صَدَقْتَ
أَنَّ هَذَا الَّذِي نَعْلَمُ. فَبَايَعُوا مُحَمَّدًا جَمِيعًا وَمَسَحُوا عَلَيَّ يَدِهِ..

A group of "Bani Hashim" gathered up in "Abwa" {a place between Mecca and Medina}.
"Abraham ibn Muhammad" {the first Abbasid caliph who was known as imam "Abraham"},
"Abu Ja'far Mansur" {known as Mansur Dawaniqi}, "Salih ibn Ali" {Mansur's uncle}, "Abdullah
ibn Hasan" {son of Hasan Muthanna} and his two sons named "Abraham" and "Muhammad",
and "Muhammad ibn Abdullah", son of "Amr ibn Uthman" were amongst people.

"Salih ibn Ali" said :... then "Abdullah ibn Hasan" began talking and praised god and said: you
know very well that this child of mine {Muhammad} is the same {promised} "Mahdi" {that
messenger of Allah talked about} so hurry up, let's go swearing allegiance with him.

Then "Mansur "Dawaniqi" said: why are you wasting your time, swear to god you know well
that people won't obey anyone's order as much as this young man "Muhammad ibn Abdullah".
All said: yes, swear to god you're right, this is what we know very well. So, {because of these
words} all of them swore allegiance with "Muhammad".

"Abu al-Farj Isfahani" – Maqatil al-Talibin – p 141

Reviewing this possibility:

Seyed "Ibn Tавus" and Allameh "Majlisi" have said that imam Hassan's [a.s] children never
had such belief that "Muhammad ibn Abdullah al-Hasan" is promised "Mahdi".

Seyed "ibnTavus" writes:

ان بني الحسن عليه السلام ما كانوا يعتقدون فيمن خرج منهم انه المهدي صلوات الله عليه
وآله وان تسموا بذلك ان اولهم خروجا واولهم تسميا بالمهدي محمد بن عبد الله بن الحسن
عليه السلام.

Children of imam "Hassan" [a.s] didn't believe that the one who arises from them, is promised "Mahdi". However they'd name themselves "Mahdi". The first person who arose and had this name is "Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn Hasan".

"Ibn Tavus" – al-Iqbal – vol. 3, p 88 /// "Al-Majlisi" – Bihar al-Anwar – vol. 47, p 304

To confirm his opinion, "Ibn Tavus" says several narratives including this one:

وروي في حديث قبله بكراريس من الأمالي عن أبي خالد الواسطي أَنَّ مُحَمَّدَ بْنَ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الْحَسَنِ قَالَ: يَا أَبَا خَالِدٍ إِنِّي خَارِجٌ وَأَنَا وَاللَّهِ مَقْتُولٌ ثُمَّ ذَكَرَ عُدْرَهُ فِي خُرُوجِهِ مَعَ عِلْمِهِ أَنَّهُ مَقْتُولٌ . وكل ذلك يكشف عن تمسكهم بالله والرسول صلي الله عليه وآله.

"Yahya ibn al-Husain" quotes from "Abu Khalid Wasiti" in "Amali" book that "Muhammad ibn Abdullah ibn Hasan" said: O "Abu Khalid", I'll arise, swear to I'll be killed then he said his excuse while we knew that he'll be killed. "Ibn Tavus" says: it's a reason that shows that "Bani al-Hasan" didn't go out of truth rout and would resort to god and messenger of Allah.

"IbnTavus" – Al-Iqbal – vol. 3, p 88

2: "Muhammad ibn Abdullah abi Ja'far Mansur":

According to historical resources, the second person who claimed that he's "Mahdi" and his name was "Muhammad", son of "Muhammad", is "Mahdi Abbasid".

As "Ibn Taymiyah" and "Ibn Kathir" have reported, "Mahdi Abbasid " was given title of "Mahdi" until he can be the same person whom Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] had given glad tiding of his appearance.

"Ibn Taymiyah Harani", one of the founders of Wahhabism, writes about him:

ولهذا لما كان الحديث المعروف عند السلف والخلف أن النبي صلي الله عليه وسلم قال في المهدي يواطيه اسمه اسمي واسم أبيه اسم أبي، صار يطمع كثير من الناس في أن يكون هو المهدي حتى سمي المنصور ابنه محمد ولقبه بالمهدي مواطأة لاسمه باسمه واسم أبيه باسم أبيه ولكن لم يكن هو الموعود به.

Since this narrative {Mahdi's name is like my name and his father's name is the same as my father's name} said by messenger of Allah [PBUH] was well-known amongst elders, many people thought that "Muhammad ibn Abdullah abi Ja'far Mansur" is "Mahdi" and even "Mansur" named his son "Muhammad" until his name and his father's name match with Prophet Muhammad's name and his father's name, but he wasn't promised "Mahdi".

"Ibn Taymiyah Harani" – Minhaj al-Sunnah al-Nabawiyah – vol. 4, p 98

"Ibn Kathir" says about him:

وإنما لقب بالمهدي رجاء أن يكون الموعود به في الأحاديث.

He was called "Mahdi" hoping that he's promised "Mahdi" written in narratives.

"Ibn Kathir Damascus" – al-Bidayah wa al-Nihayah- vol. 10, p 151

According to what was said, there were people throughout history who claimed to be "Mahdi", but as for these two persons, there is more possibility that they faked such narratives for themselves; because both their own name and their fathers' name is match with narratives that have this extra sentence. So, it's more likely that their followers faked this extra part of narrative.

3: Sunni scholars say that "Mahdi" [a.s] is son of imam "Hasan Askari" [a.s]:

Another response to the second of narratives is that some of elders of Sunni scholars restate that hadrat "Mahdi" [a.s] is son of imam "Hasan Askari" [a.s] and it shows that narratives containing this extra sentence aren't acceptable by this group of Sunni scholars.

1: "Fakhr al-Razi":

He's one of the Sunni famous Quran interpreters and says: hadrat "Mahdi" [a.s] is son of imam "Hasan Askari" [a.s]:

أما الحسن العسكري الإمام (ع) فله إبنان وبنتان، أما الإبنان فأحدهما صاحب الزمان عجل الله فرجه الشريف، والثاني موسي درج في حياة أبيه وأم البنتان ففاطمة درجت في حياة أبيها، وأم موسي درجت أيضاً.

But imam "Hasan Askari" [a.s] had two sons and two daughters, his sons are hadrat "Mahdi" [a.s] and "Musa" who died when imam "Askari" [a.s] was alive, the same goes for his daughters and mother of "Musa".

"Al-Razi Shafi'i" – al-Shajarah al-Mubarakah – p 78 – 79

2: "Asimi Macchi":

He's one of Shafi'i scholars and says about birth of hadrat "Mahdi" [a.s]:

الإمام الحسن العسكري بن علي الهادي... ولده محمداً أوحده وهو الإمام محمد المهدي بن الحسن العسكري بن علي التقي بن محمد الجواد ابن علي الرضا بن موسى الكاظم بن جعفر الصادق بن محمد الباقر بن علي زين العابدين بن الحسين بن علي بن أبي طالب رضي الله تعالى عنهم أجمعين.

The only son of imam "Hasan Askari" is imam "Muhammad ibn al-Hasan Askari".

"Al-Asimi Macchi" – Samt al-Nojoom al-Awali – vol. 4, p 150

We realize from what Sunni scholars said that they don't accept first group of narratives otherwise they wouldn't restate that his name is "Mahdi" and his father's name is "Hasan", this is another reason that shows narratives of first group are faked.

Narratives with extra sentence are interpreters of narratives without extra sentence!

If someone says: in second group of narratives, narrators didn't want to say rest of the narrative {his father's name is the same as my father's name} because, in their opinion, saying it wasn't necessary, so, now that they haven't said it, it's not reason that this sentence in first group of narratives is faked. We say in response:

Firstly: extra sentence should have authentic document to be interpreter

As it was proved this extra sentence hasn't been quoted with any authentic document to be interpreter of narratives without this extra sentence and their complementary!

The only reliable document was narrative quoted by "Asim" from "Zarr" that "Asim" had quoted it incomplete and as Sunni scholars say, "Asim" is "Muztarib al-Hadith" {he'd quote the same narrative differently}, that's why his saying can't be proof.

Second response:

As it was said in the beginning of article, "Ibn Taymiyyah" and many of Sunni scholars believed that there is contradictory between narratives with extra sentence and narratives without it, that's why "Ibn Taymiyyah" had said that Shia scholars have faked narratives without extra sentence which means he's seen contradictory between these two groups of narratives otherwise he's say narratives with extra sentence are complementary of narratives without it.

Saying of Allameh "Kanji" proves above issue:

والقول الفصل في ذلك أن الإمام أحمد مع ضبطه وإتقانه روي هذا الحديث في مسنده في عدة مواضع واسمه اسمي.

Last word is that imam "Ahmad ibn Hanbal" who was accurate and meticulous in writing narratives has quoted this narrative in his several pages of his "Musnad" without extra sentence and only with this sentence "his name is the same as me".

[Kashf al-Ghummah fi Ma'rifat al-A'immah- vol. 3, p 277](#)

Result:

Considering Sunni scholars remarks who say: this sentence "And his father's name is like my father's name" has been added to this narrative, or that they say: name of hadrat "Mahdi" is "Muhammad" and his father's name is "Hasan Askari", we realize that narratives with extra sentence are lie and faked. When it's proved that narratives of first group are faked, it'll be proved that narratives without extra sentence are authentic without opponent.

4: assuming that narratives with this extra sentence "His father's name is like my father's name" are true, their text is justifiable.

Notable point in understanding these narratives is that even if we assume that narratives with extra sentence are true, we should study words written in these narratives meticulously:

1: the meaning of "His father's name" {in extra sentence} is the nickname of imam "Husain" [a.s]:

Allameh "Kanji Shafi'i" says: the meaning of "his father" is the nickname of imam "Husain" [a.s] and messenger of Allah [PBUH] has put this nickname as name for imam Mahdi's [a.s] father to make us understand that hadrat "Mahdi" [a.s] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" not imam "Hassan" [a.s].

Since Allameh Kanji's book isn't available, we quote his saying written in the books belong to Allameh "Isa Irbeli" and "Allameh "Majlisi" {they've quoted it from "Kifayat al-Talib" book written by Allameh "Kanji"}:

« وَإِنْ صَحَّ فَمَعْنَاهُ وَاسْمُ أَبِيهِ اسْمَ أَبِي أَيِ الْحُسَيْنِ وَكُنْيَتُهُ أَبُو عَبْدِ اللَّهِ فَجَعَلَ الْكُنْيَةَ اسْمًا كِنَايَةً عَنْ أَنَّهُ مِنْ وُلْدِ الْحُسَيْنِ دُونَ الْحَسَنِ »

If this sentence "His father's name is the same as my father's name" is true, it means the nickname of imam "Husain ibn Ali" [a.s], because his nickname is "Abu Abdullah" and messenger of Allah [PBUH] put his nickname as name for hadrat Mahdi's father, this work of messenger of Allah [PBUH] shows that "Mahdi" is from the descendent of "Husain" not "Hassan" [a.s].

"Isa Irbeli"- Kashf al-Ghummah fi Ma'rifat al-A'imma – vol. 3, p 277 /// "Al-Majlisi" – Bihar al-Anwar – vol. 51, p 86

2: This sentence "His father's name is like my name" has probably miswritten:

"Kanji Shafi'i" says: it might that this narrative has been miswritten which means messenger of Allah [PBUH] has said "his father's name is like my son's name" but narrator has written "his father's name is like my father's name":

ويحتمل ان يكون الراوي توهم قوله «ابني» فصحفه فقال «أبي».

"Al-Irbeli" – Kashf al-Ghummah fi Ma'rifat al-A'immah – vol. 3, p 277

"Ibn Tariq Helli" has great opinion about this possibility, he says:

اعلم أن الذي قد تقدم في الصحاح مما يماثل هذا الخبر، من قوله صلى الله عليه وآله: يواطئ اسمه اسمي، واسم أبيه اسم أبي، هو ان الكلام في ذلك لا يخلو من أحد قسمين:

اما أن يكون النبي صلى الله عليه وآله أراد بقوله: واسم أبيه اسم أبي، انه جعله علامة تدل علي أنه من ولد الحسين دون الحسن، لان لا يعتقد معتقد ذلك. فإن كان مراده ذلك، فهو المقصود، وهو المراد بالخبر، لان المهدي عليه السلام بلا خلاف من ولد الحسين عليه السلام، فيكون اسم أبيه مشابهاً لكنية الحسين فيكون قد انتظم اللفظ [و] المعني وصار حقيقة فيه.

والقسم الثاني: أن يكون الراوي وهم من قوله: ابني إلي قوله أبي، فيكون قد وهم بحرف تقديره أنه قال: ابني، فقال: هو، "أبي". والمراد بابنه الحسن، لان المهدي عليه السلام محمد بن الحسن باجماع كافة الأمة... فقد اتضح بما قلناه وجه التحقيق، ولله المنة والحمد.

Messenger of Allah [PBUH] has said this sentence "And his father's name is like my father's name" to show that "Mahdi" [a.s] is from the descendent of imam "Husain" [a.s] not imam "Hassan" [a.s]. if messenger of Allah [PBUH] meant this, it'll be the meaning of narrative as well; because "Mahdi" [a.s] is undoubtedly from descendent of imam "Husain" [a.s]. so, his father's name is like nickname of imam "Husain" [a.s].

Or we can say: messenger of Allah [PBUH] said: "His father's name is like my son's name" but narrator thought that he said: "his father's name is like my father's name". in this case, the meaning of "My son" is imam "Hassan" and Prophet Muhammad [PBUH] wanted to say: the name of Mahdi's father is like my son's name "Hassan"; because there is consensus amongst people that Mahdis' [a.s] father is "Hassan Askari".

"Ibn Tariq al-Helli" – Umdat al-Uyoun – p 437

After quoting this possibility, Seyed "Muhammad Amin" says in "A'yan al-Shia": it's likely that this sentence has been miswritten:

“أقول: احتمال التصحيف قريب جدا لتقارب الكلمتين في الحروف وكون الخط القديم أكثره بدون نقط وقد أورد هذا المضمون أيضا أصحابنا في كتبهم”

It might that it's been miswritten; because these two words "أبي" {my father} and "ابني" {my son} have the same letters and old writings were mostly without dot.

"Al-Amin" – A'yan al-Shia – vol. 2, p 50

Conclusion:

1: narratives containing this sentence "his name is like my name" {without extra sentence} have been quoted with authentic document in Sunni resources and this claim of "Ibn Taymiyyah" that narratives without extra sentence were faked by Shias is either because of his ignorance toward Sunni narratives or he's trying to hide the truth and after proving this issue, first group of narratives that agrees with Shias' opinion, means narratives without extra sentence "his name is like my name" are proved and Sunni should prove that this narrative has written with extra sentence as well.

2: all documents of Sunni narratives with extra this sentence "his father's name is like my father's name" are either invalid or can't be proof because their narrator is "Muztarib al-Hadith".

3: narratives with this extra sentence "And his father's name is like my father's name" can't be interpreter of narratives without this sentence, because Sunni scholars have restated that there is contradictory between these two narratives and some of them have said that narratives without extra sentence are faked and another group of them have said that name of imam Mahdi's [a.s] father is imam "Hassan Askari" [a.s].

Thus, this belief of Shia that name of hadrat Mahdi's [a.s] father is "Hasan Askari", has root in authentic narratives written in Shia and Sunni resources and these narratives confirm our belief.

Good luck.